

Document Pack



Mark James LLM, DPA, DCA
Prif Weithredwr,
Chief Executive,
Neuadd y Sir, Caerfyrddin. SA31 1JP
County Hall, Carmarthen. SA31 1JP

WEDNESDAY, 18 OCTOBER 2017

TO: MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

I HEREBY SUMMON YOU TO ATTEND A MEETING OF THE **MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL** WHICH WILL BE HELD IN THE **COMMITTEE ROOM 2, 3 SPILMAN STREET, CARMARTHEN AT 2.00 PM, ON THURSDAY, 26TH OCTOBER, 2017** FOR THE TRANSACTION OF THE BUSINESS OUTLINED ON THE ATTACHED AGENDA

Mark James CBE

CHIEF EXECUTIVE



PLEASE RECYCLE

Democratic Officer:	Kevin Thomas
Telephone (direct line):	01267 224027
E-Mail:	kjthomas@carmarthenshire.gov.uk
Ref:	AD016-001

**MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS
PANEL
3 OR 4 MEMBERS**

EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR TECHNICAL SERVICES

1. Cynghorydd/Councillor **H.A.L. Evans**

EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN

1. Councillor **G. Davies**

LOCAL MEMBER(S) FOR THE APPELLANT LEARNER'S WARD

1. Councillor **M. Charles**

NOTE:-

1. THE CHAIR OF THE MEMBERS APPEAL PANEL SHALL BE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR TECHNICAL SERVICES (OR IN HIS OR HER ABSENCE THE EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION AND CHILDRENS SERVICES)
2. NO SUBSTITUTES ARE ALLOWED AT MEETINGS OF THE PANEL

AGENDA

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.
2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST
3. TO SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE MEETINGS HELD ON THE FOLLOWING DATES:-
 - 3.1 26 SEPTEMBER, 2017 (2.00 P.M.) 5 - 8
 - 3.2 26TH SEPTEMBER, 2017 (2.40 P.M.) 9 - 12
 - 3.3 26TH SEPTEMBER, 2017 (3.20 P.M.) 13 - 14
 - 3.4 26TH SEPTEMBER, 2017 (3.40 P.M.) 15 - 16
4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

THE REPORT RELATING TO THE FOLLOWING ITEM IS NOT FOR PUBLICATION AS IT CONTAINS EXEMPT INFORMATION AS DEFINED IN PARAGRAPH 12 OF PART 4 OF SCHEDULE 12A TO THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT ACT, 1972 AS AMENDED BY THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT (ACCESS TO INFORMATION) (VARIATION) (WALES) ORDER 2007. IF FOLLOWING THE APPLICATION OF THE PUBLIC INTEREST TEST THE PANEL RESOLVES PURSUANT TO THE ACT TO CONSIDER THIS ITEM IN PRIVATE, THE PUBLIC WILL BE EXCLUDED FROM THE MEETING DURING SUCH CONSIDERATION
5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT B.A. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT. 17 - 38
6. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT E.G.W AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT 39 - 60

This page is intentionally left blank

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

Tuesday, 26 September 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)**Councillors:**

F. Akhtar, G. Davies and S.L. Davies

The following Officers were in attendance:

S. Davies, Modernisation Services Manager
 A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport
 K. Morris, Assistant Solicitor
 K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

Committee Room 2, 3 Spilman Street, Carmarthen - 2.00 - 2.35 pm**1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. TO SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON THE 22ND AUGUST, 2017**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting of the Panel held on the 22nd August be signed as a correct record.**4. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC****RESOLVED**, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following items were not for publication as the reports contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.**5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT A.L.W. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT.**Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant A.L.W. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of public transport from A.L.W's home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis A.L.W.'s home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

6. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT E.M.S. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 4 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant E.M.S free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of public transport from A.L.W's home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis E.M.S's home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

CHAIR

DATE

This page is intentionally left blank

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

Tuesday, 26 September 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies, P. Hughes-Griffiths and K. Lloyd

The following Officers were in attendance:

S. Davies, Modernisation Services Manager
 A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport
 K. Morris, Assistant Solicitor
 K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

Committee Room 2, 3 Spilman Street, Carmarthen - 2.40 - 3.00 pm

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

Name	Minute Number	Nature of Interest
S. Davies – Modernisation Services Manager	4 – To consider an appeal by applicant C.J.C. against a decision by officers for the non-provision of free school transport	Knows the Applicant
S. Davies – Modernisation Services Manager	5 – To consider an appeal by applicant L.T.H and J.T.H. against a decision by officers for the non- provision of free school transport	Knows the Applicants

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following items were not for publication as the reports contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT C.J.C. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

(NOTE: Mr S. Davies having earlier declared an interest in this item, remained in the meeting to answer any school related questions but took no part in the consideration or determination of the appeal).

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant C.J.C. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of public transport from C.J.C.s' home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis C.J.C.s' home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

5. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT L.T.H. & J.T.H. AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

(NOTE: Mr S. Davies having earlier declared an interest in this item, remained in the meeting to answer any school related questions but took no part in the consideration or determination of the appeal).

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant both L.T.H. and J.T.H. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of public transport from the appellants' home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis L.T.H. and J.T.H.s' home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

CHAIR

DATE

This page is intentionally left blank

MEMBERS HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT APPEALS PANEL

Tuesday, 26 September 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies and D.M. Jenkins

The following Officers were in attendance:

S. Davies, Modernisation Services Manager
A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport
K. Morris, Assistant Solicitor
K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

Committee Room 2, 3 Spilman Street, Carmarthen - 3.20 - 3.35 pm

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

There were no apologies for absence.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest.

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following items were not for publication as the reports contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT I.H AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant I.H. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking

distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of a fare paying bus, which was not available for public use, from I.H.s' home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that due to the exceptional circumstances, the appeal submitted by I.H. for free home to school transport be upheld.

CHAIR

DATE

Tuesday, 26 September 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.A.L. Evans (Chair)

Councillors:

G. Davies and J.D. James

The following Officers were in attendance:

S. Davies, Modernisation Services Manager
A. Evans, Operations Manager - Passenger Transport
K. Morris, Assistant Solicitor
K. Thomas, Democratic Services Officer

Committee Room 2, 3 Spilman Street, Carmarthen - 3.40 - 4.05 pm

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was received from Councillor A. Fox.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTEREST

There were no declarations of personal interest,

3. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED, pursuant to the Local Government Act 1972, as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007 that the following items were not for publication as the reports contained exempt information as defined in Paragraph 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A to the Act.

4. TO CONSIDER AN APPEAL BY APPLICANT J.M.L AGAINST A DECISION BY OFFICERS FOR THE NON-PROVISION OF FREE SCHOOL TRANSPORT

Following the application of the public interest test it was **UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED** pursuant to the Act referred to in minute 3 above, not to publicise the content of the report as it contained exempt information relating to a particular individual.

The public interest test in this matter related to the fact that the report included personal information relating to the applicant. Although disclosure would support transparency and accountability in the decision making process, the public interest in maintaining confidentiality outweighed the public interest in disclosure because of the need to protect the identity of the applicant and the family.

The Chair welcomed officers from Legal, Environment and Education & Children Services to the meeting.

The Panel considered the written representations of the appellant in respect of the refusal of the Stage 1 Review Panel to grant J.M.L. free school transport to the nearest LEA designated school which was located within the statutory walking

distance and therefore, did not meet the criteria outlined in the Council's policy for the provision of assistance.

The Panel considered the observations of the departmental officers, together with the individual circumstances of the case. The Panel also sought clarification on elements of the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the availability of public transport from J.M.L.s' home address to the designated school and also the assessment of the walking route to the school undertaken in accordance with Welsh Government Guidelines.

RESOLVED that in line with the Authority's Home to School Transport Policy, the appeal be refused on the basis J.M.L.s' home address was located within the statutory walking distance of the designated Local Education Authority School and that the walking route had been assessed as being suitable in accordance with Welsh Government Criteria.

CHAIR

DATE

Agenda Item 5

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 6

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 12 of Part 4 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 as amended by the Local Government (Access to Information) (Variation) (Wales) Order 2007.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank